

# THE STATES assembled on Monday 14th December 2020, at 9.30 a.m. under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff, Robert James MacRae, Esquire.

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson – excused attendance (joined at 5.12 p.m.) Connétable Alan Simon Crowcroft of St. Helier – excused attendance (joined at 9.43 a.m.) Connétable John Michael Le Bailly of St. Mary – excused attendance (joined at 5.44 p.m.)

Prayers

## Standing Order 55A – meeting held remotely

THE STATES assembled remotely, in accordance with Standing Order 55A, as the Bailiff considered that it was not possible to convene or maintain a quorate meeting in view of a substantial risk to the health of both States Members and the public.

#### Subordinate enactments tabled

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Covid-19 (Workplace Restrictions) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Order 2020.	R&O.152/2020.
Minister for Health and Social Services.	

Covid-19 (Safe Distancing – Exception and Revocation of Suspension) (Jersey) R&O.158/2020. Order 2020.

Minister for Health and Social Services.

Covid-19 (Workplace Restrictions) (Amendment No. 5) (Jersey) Order 2020.	R&O.161/2020.
Minister for Health and Social Services.	

Emergency Powers and Planning (Medicines and Vaccines – Covid-19 and R&O.162/2020. Influenza) (Jersey) Order 2020.

Minister for Health and Social Services.

Road Traffic (Speed Limits) (Amendment No. 12) (Jersey) Order 2020.	R&O.163/2020.
Minister for Infrastructure.	

Covid-19 (Workplace – Fifteenth Extension) (Jersey) Order 2020.	R&O.164/2020.
Minister for Health and Social Services.	

Regulation of Care (Fees) (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Order 2020.	R&O.165/2020.
Minister for the Environment.	

Covid-19 (Gathering Control) (Jersey) Order 2020. R&O.166/2020. *Minister for Health and Social Services.* 

## **Documents presented**

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): fourth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(4)) P.130/2020. comments. Amd.(4). Presented: 11th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): fifth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(5)) – P.130/2020. comments. Amd.(5). Presented: 14th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): sixth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(6)) – P.130/2020. addendum. Amd.(6). Presented: 11th December 2020. Add. Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel. Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): sixth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(6)) – P.130/2020. comments. Amd.(6). Presented: 11th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. Government Plan P.130/2020. 2021-2024 (P.130/2020): amendment seventh (P.130/2020 Amd.(7)) – comments. Amd.(7). Presented: 11th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): eighth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(8)) P.130/2020. - addendum. Amd.(8). Presented: 11th December 2020. Add. Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel. Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): eighth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(8)) P.130/2020. comments. Amd.(8). Com. Presented: 11th December 2020. Council of Ministers. Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): ninth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(9)) – P.130/2020. comments. Amd.(9). Presented: 14th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. Government Plan 2021-2024 (P.130/2020): thirteenth amendment P.130/2020. (P.130/2020 Amd.(13)) – comments. Amd.(13). Presented: 11th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. (P.130/2020): P.130/2020. Government Plan 2021-2024 fourteenth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(14)) - comments.Amd.(14). Presented: 11th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers. Government Plan 2021-2024 (P.130/2020): fifteenth P.130/2020. amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(15)) - comments.Amd.(15). Presented: 11th December 2020. Com. Council of Ministers.

Government P (P.130/2020 Amd. Presented: 11th De Council of Minister	(16)) – co ecember 2		(P.130/2020):	sixteenth	amendment	P.130/2020. Amd.(16). Com.
Government Pl (P.130/2020 Amd.) Presented: 14th De Deputy R.J. Ward	(18)) – ad ecember 2	2020.	(P.130/2020):	eighteenth	amendment	P.130/2020. Amd.(18). Add.
Government Pl (P.130/2020 Amd.) Presented: 14th De Council of Minister	(18)) – co ecember 2		(P.130/2020):	eighteenth	amendment	P.130/2020. Amd.(18). Com.
Government Properties (P.130/2020 Amd.) Presented: 14th December Council of Minister.	(19)) – co ecember 2		(P.130/2020):	nineteenth	amendment	P.130/2020. Amd.(19). Com.
Government P (P.130/2020 Amd.) Presented: 11th De Council of Minister	(20)) – co ecember 2		(P.130/2020):	twentieth	amendment	P.130/2020. Amd.(20). Com.
Government Pl (P.130/2020 Amd.) Presented: 11th De Council of Minister	(21)) – co ecember 2		(P.130/2020):	twenty-first	amendment	P.130/2020. Amd.(21). Com.
States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of Functions – Minister for the Environment – Appointment of an Assistant Minister.  Presented: 4th December 2020.  Minister for the Environment.						R.135/2020.
Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority: Chief Executive – Appointment. Presented: 7th December 2020.  Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.					R.136/2020.	
Sustainable Transport Policy – Status Update – November 2020.  Presented: 7th December 2020.  Minister for Infrastructure.  R.137					R.137/2020.	
States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of Functions – Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture – Appointment of Assistant Ministers. Presented: 8th December 2020.  Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.					R.138/2020.	
States of Jersey Complaints Board: Findings – Complaint by Mr. S. Newman against the Treasury and Exchequer Department regarding the Valuation and Calculation of Pension Entitlements.  Presented: 9th December 2020.					R.139/2020.	

Privileges and Procedures Committee.

Transfers Between Heads of Expenditure Under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law R.140/2020.

2019: Article 18-11th December 2020.

Presented: 14th December 2020. *Minister for Treasury and Resources*.

Land Transactions Under Standing Order 168(3) – La Haule Beach Café Groundsite, R.141/2020.

 $La\ Route\ de\ la\ Haule,\ St.\ Brelade-Lease.$ 

Presented: 14th December 2020. *Minister for Infrastructure*.

Land Transactions Under Standing Order 168(3) – Gift, Cession and Transfer of Land R.142/2020. at Le Squez to the Parish of St. Clement.

Presented: 14th December 2020. *Minister for Infrastructure*.

Land Transactions Under Standing Order 168(3) – B36 L'Avenue de la Commune, R.143/2020. St. Brelade – Acquisition of Land for Footway Widening at Roberts Garage.

Presented: 14th December 2020. *Minister for Infrastructure*.

Scrutiny Review of the Government Plan: 2021–2024 – Economic and International S.R.14/2020.

Affairs Scrutiny Panel Report. Presented: 4th December 2020.

Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel.

Government Plan Review: 2021–2024. S.R.15/2020.

Presented: 7th December 2020. *Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.* 

Scrutiny Review of the Government Plan 2021–2024. S.R.16/2020.

Presented: 10th December 2020. *Government Plan Review Panel.* 

Review of the Efficiencies Plan and Government Plan 2021–2024 Rebalancing S.R.17/2020.

Measures.
Presented: 14th December 2020.

Government Efficiencies Review Panel.

Review of the Jersey Care Model (S.R.5/2020) – response of the Minister for Health and Social Services.

S.R.5/2020.

Res.

Presented: 11th December 2020.

Minister for Health and Social Services.

Prior Year Basis Tax Reform – response of the Minister for Treasury and Resources.

S.R.7/2020.

Presented: 14th December 2020.

Res.

Minister for Treasury and Resources.

#### **Notification of lodged propositions**

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.) – P.130/2020. amendment. Amd.Amd.

Lodged: 7th December 2020.

Council of Ministers.

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): second amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(2)) – amendment.  Lodged: 7th December 2020.  Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(2). Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): third amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(3)) – amendment.  Lodged: 7th December 2020.  Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(3). Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): seventh amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(7)) – amendment.  Lodged: 7th December 2020.  Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.	P.130/2020. Amd.(7). Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): tenth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(10)) – amendment.  Lodged: 8th December 2020.  Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(10). Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): eleventh amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(11)) – amendment. Lodged: 8th December 2020. Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(11). Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): eleventh amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(11)) – amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(11) Amd.) – amendment. Lodged: 10th December 2020. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier.	P.130/2020. Amd.(11). Amd.Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): twelfth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)) – amendment. Lodged: 7th December 2020.  Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(12). Amd.
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): twelfth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)) – second amendment.  Lodged: 11th December 2020.  Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(12). Amd.(2). (re-issue)
Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): seventeenth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(17)) – amendment. Lodged: 14th December 2020. Council of Ministers.	P.130/2020. Amd.(17). Amd.
Draft Finance (2021 Budget) (Jersey) Law 202- (P.147/2020): amendment. Lodged: 7th December 2020.  Minister for Treasury and Resources.	P.147/2020. Amd.
Draft Amendment (No. 51) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey. Lodged: 4th December 2020.  Deputy S.M. Wickenden of St. Helier.	P.161/2020.
Draft Financial Services Ombudsman (Board – Amendment) (Jersey) Regulations 202 Lodged: 7th December 2020.	P.162/2020.

Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.

Jersey Employment and Discrimination Tribunal: Appointment of Side Members. P.164/2020.

Lodged: 10th December 2020. *Minister for Social Security*.

Residential Properties in the Waterfront Development. P.165/2020.

Lodged: 11th December 2020.

Senator S.Y. Mézec.

Amendment of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey to Provide for Political P.166/2020.

Parties.

Lodged: 11th December 2020.

Senator S.Y. Mézec.

Our Hospital: Preferred Access Route. P.167/2020.

Lodged 14th December 2020.

Council of Ministers.

#### Statements on a matter of official responsibility

(see Official Report/Hansard)

The Chief Minister made a statement regarding the Government Plan 2021–2024.

## Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chief Minister, agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of the following propositions in order that they might be debated at the present meeting –

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): tenth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(10)) – amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(10)Amd.), lodged by the Connétable of St. Helier;

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): nineteenth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(19)), lodged by Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier;

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): twentieth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(20)), lodged by Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier;

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): twenty-first amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(21)), lodged by the Connétable of St. Brelade;

Draft Finance (2021 Budget) (Jersey) Law 202- (P.147/2020): amendment (P.147/2020 Amd.), lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources; and

Draft Health Insurance Fund (Miscellaneous Provisions) (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Law 202-(P.156/2020), lodged by the Minister for Social Security.

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chief Minister, agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 80, to suspend Standing Order 32 in order that the following propositions might be listed for consideration at the present meeting; and further agreed in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of the same propositions in order that they might be debated at the present meeting –

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): eleventh amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(11)) – amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(11) Amd.) – amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(11)Amd.Amd.), lodged by Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier;

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): twelfth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)) - second amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)Amd.(2)), lodged by the Council of Ministers; and

Government Plan 2021–2024 (P.130/2020): seventeenth amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(17) – amendment (P.130/2020 Amd.(17)Amd.), lodged by the Council of Ministers.

#### Government Plan 2021–2024 P.130/2020

THE STATES, commencing consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Government Plan 2021–2024' (P.130/2020), commenced consideration of an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(7)) and, adopting an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(7)Amd.), agreed that, after the words "Stamp Duty", each time they appeared, there should be inserted the words "and Land Transactions Tax".

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (a), after the words "Article 9(2)(a) of the Law" there should be inserted the words –

", except that the 2021 Estimate for Stamp Duty and Land Transactions Tax shall be increased by £335,000 by amending the Stamp Duty and Land Transactions Tax bands in accordance with the table below, with other affected lines in Summary Table 1 to be updated accordingly –

Transaction value up to	2019 Rate	2020 Rate	Proposed new rate
1 – 50	0.5% up to 50k	0.5% up to 50k	-
50,001 – 300	1.5% on excess up to 300k	1.5% on excess up to 300k	-
300,001 – 500	2% on excess up to 500k	2% on excess up to 500k	-
500,001 – 700	3% on excess up to 700k	3% on excess up to 700k	-
700,001 – 1	3.5% on excess up to 1m	3.5% on excess up to 1m	-
1,000,001 – 1.5	4.5% on excess up to 1.5m	4.5% on excess up to 1.5m	-
1,500,001 - 2	5.5% on excess up to 2m	5.5% on excess up to 2m	-
2,000,001 - 3	6.5% on excess up to 3m	6.5% on excess up to 3m	7%
3,000,001 – 6	8.5% on excess up to 6m	8.5% on excess up to 6m	9.5%
6,000,001 +	9.5% on excess	9.5% on excess	10.5%

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.) and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.130/2020 Amd.Amd.), agreed that for paragraphs 1 and 2, there should be substituted the following paragraph –

## "1 PAGE 3, PARAGRAPH (i) -

After the words "Appendix 3 to the Report" insert the words –

", except that the heads of expenditure for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance shall be increased by the following amounts to provide for the establishment of a Public Services Ombudsman –

2022; £200,000 2023: £401,000 2024: £412,000"."

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (j), after the words "Appendix 3 to the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that the heads of expenditure for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance shall be increased by the following amounts to provide for the establishment of a Public Services Ombudsman –

2022; £200,000 2023: £401,000 2024: £412,000".

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(3)and, adopting an amendment of the Council (P.130/2020 Amd.(3)Amd.), agreed that paragraph 1 should be deleted and that, in paragraph 2, for the words "the Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills shall be increased by £100,000 to allow for the review and realignment of the budget for care leavers with demand" there should be substituted the words "General Reserve shall be increased by £100,000 with this amount ring-fenced for care leavers".

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (f), after the words "Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the head of expenditure for General Reserve shall be increased by £100,000 with this amount ring-fenced for care leavers".

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(2)) and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.130/2020 Amd.(2)Amd.), agreed that, for the words "Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills shall be increased by £159,000 to allow for increased funding for the Jersey Premium, with other affected lines in Summary Table 5(i) to be updated accordingly" there should be substituted the words "General Reserve shall be increased by £159,000 with this amount ring-fenced for the Jersey Premium".

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (f), after the words "Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the head of expenditure for the General Reserve shall be increased by £159,000 with this amount ring-fenced for the Jersey Premium"."

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.130/2020 Amd.(11)) and, commencing an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.130/2020 Amd.(11)Amd.), adopted an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier

(P.130/2020 Amd.(11)Amd.Amd.) that, for the words "£150,000", there should be substituted the words "£300,000".

THE STATES resumed consideration of the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier and, adopting the amendment of the Council of Ministers, as amended, agreed that, for the sub-paragraph following the words "insert the words -", there should be substituted the following sub-paragraph -

", except that in Summary Table 5(i) the Total Revenue Head of Expenditure for Customer and Local Services shall be increased by £300,000 to provide support as required during 2021 for Beresford Street Kitchen, and that the Council of Ministers shall request officers to work with the organisation to support the development of a financially sustainable business model for future years".

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (f), after the words "Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that in Summary Table 5(i) the Total Revenue Head of Expenditure for Customer and Local Services shall be increased by £300,000 to provide support as required during 2021 for Beresford Street Kitchen, and that the Council of Ministers shall request officers to work with the organisation to support the development of a financially sustainable business model for future years".

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of the Connétable of St. Brelade (P.130/2020 Amd.(21)), agreed that –

in paragraph (i), after the words "Appendix 2 – Summary Table 9 to the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that the expenditure from the Fund shall be increased by £300,000 to fund tree preservation initiatives"; and

in paragraph (j), after the words "Appendix 3 to the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that on page 79 of Appendix 3, after the words "Marine Resources management and natural environment" there shall be inserted the following words –

"Commitment to funding tree preservation initiatives: additional expenditure per year of £75,000 in the years 2022, 2023, and 2024."

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour (P.130/2020 Amd.(17)) and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.130/2020 Amd.(17)Amd.), agreed that —

the existing paragraph should be designated as paragraph 2 and the following paragraph should be inserted -

#### "1 PAGE 2, PARAGRAPH (f) -

After the words "of the Report" insert the words –

", except that in Summary Table 5(i), the Total Revenue Head of Expenditure for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance shall be increased by £150,000 to provide funding for Statistics Jersey to undertake additional surveys and analysis as needed to complement the

results of the 2019/2020 Living Costs and Household Income Survey and to provide funding to develop a Poverty Strategy"."; and

for the existing sub-paragraph in the paragraph re-designated as paragraph 2, there should be substituted the following sub-paragraph -

"We commit to funding Statistics Jersey to undertake additional surveys and analysis as needed to complement the results of the 2019/2020 Living Costs and Household Income Survey, to ensure that detailed information can be published on current levels of relative low income ("poverty") in Jersey, using both established measures and also taking account of the work of the Social Metrics Commission; and to develop a Poverty Strategy for inclusion in the 2022 Government Plan."."

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour, as amended, agreed that –

in paragraph (f), after the words "of the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that in Summary Table 5(i), the Total Revenue Head of Expenditure for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance shall be increased by £150,000 to provide funding for Statistics Jersey to undertake additional surveys and analysis as needed to complement the results of the 2019/2020 Living Costs and Household Income Survey and to provide funding to develop a Poverty Strategy"; and

in paragraph (j), after the words "Appendix 3 to the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that, on page 60, after the words "when approved by the States Assembly" there should be inserted the following words –

"We commit to funding Statistics Jersey to undertake additional surveys and analysis as needed to complement the results of the 2019/2020 Living Costs and Household Income Survey, to ensure that detailed information can be published on current levels of relative low income ("poverty") in Jersey, using both established measures and also taking account of the work of the Social Metrics Commission; and to develop a Poverty Strategy for inclusion in the 2022 Government Plan."."

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(6)), agreed that, in paragraph (a), after the words "Article 9(2)(a) of the Law" there should be inserted the words –

", except that the 2021 Estimate for Personal Income Tax shall be reduced by £240,000 by amending Child Care Tax Relief in accordance with the table below with other affected in lines Summary Table 1 to be updated accordingly -

	2020 Allowance	Increase	Proposed 2021 Allowance
Child Care Tax Relief	£6,150	£123	£6,273
Enhanced Child Care Tax Relief	£16,000	£320	£16,320

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 23 CONTRE: 21 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator K.L. Moore Senator L.J. Farnham

Senator S.W. Pallett Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré Senator S.Y. Mézec Senator T.A. Vallois Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of St. John Connétable of St. Saviour Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of Grouville Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Connétable of St. Peter Deputy of Grouville Connétable of St. Martin Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy of St. Ouen Deputy of St. Martin Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) Deputy R. Labey (H) Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H) Deputy K.F. Morel (L) Deputy of St. John Deputy of St. Mary Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H) Deputy G.J. Truscott (B) Deputy S.M. Ahier (H) Deputy J.H. Young (B) Deputy J.H. Perchard (S) Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C) Deputy R.J. Ward (H) Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L) Deputy C.S. Alves (H) Deputy of St. Peter

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(8)), agreed that, in paragraph (a), after the words "Article 9(2)(a) of the Law" there should be inserted the words —

", except that the 2021 Estimate for Personal Income Tax shall be reduced by £260,000 by amending Child Tax Allowances in accordance with the table below with other affected in lines Summary Table 1 to be updated accordingly -

	2020 Allowance	Increase	Proposed 2021 Allowance
Child Allowance	£3,000	£60	£3,060
Additional Allowance	£4,500	£90	£4,590

Members present voted as follows -

Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S) Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

POUR: 25 CONTRE: 20 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator K.L. Moore Senator I.J. Gorst Senator S.W. Pallett Senator L.J. Farnham Senator S.Y. Mézec Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré Connétable of St. Helier Senator T.A. Vallois Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of St. Saviour Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. John Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Peter Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Connétable of St. Martin Deputy of Grouville Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy M. Tadier (B) Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) Deputy of St. Ouen

Deputy R. Labey (H) Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
Deputy I. Gardiner (H)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy J.H. Young (B)
Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
Deputy of St. Peter

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.130/2020 Amd.(5)) that, in paragraph (a), after the words "Article 9(2)(a) of the Law", there should be inserted the words —

"except that the estimate of income in 2021 for Impôts Duties Fuel shall be reduced by £56,000 by reducing the rate of fuel duty paid on 2nd generation biofuel to 0%".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 21 CONTRE: 25 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator K.L. Moore Senator I.J. Gorst Senator S.W. Pallett Senator L.J. Farnham Senator S.Y. Mézec Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré Connétable of St. Helier Senator T.A. Vallois Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Saviour Connétable of St. Brelade Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. John Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. Ouen Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Deputy J.A. Martin (H) Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy of St. Martin Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) Deputy of St. John Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H) Deputy of St. Ouen Deputy S.M. Ahier (H) Deputy R. Labey (H) Deputy J.H. Perchard (S) Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H) Deputy R.J. Ward (H) Deputy of St. Mary Deputy C.S. Alves (H) Deputy G.J. Truscott (B) Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S) Deputy J.H. Young (B) Deputy I. Gardiner (H) Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C) Deputy K.F. Morel (L) Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L) Deputy of St. Peter Deputy of Trinity

#### Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the Chair of the Government Plan Review Panel had informed the Greffier of the States that the amendment of the Panel (P.130/2020 Amd.(16)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Government Plan 2021–2024' (P.130/2020) had been withdrawn.

## **Suspension of meeting**

The Deputy Bailiff suspended the meeting, in accordance with Standing Order 46, for a period of 10 minutes in order that technical problems arising from the Assembly meeting remotely could be resolved.

#### Government Plan 2021-2024 P.130/2020

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Government Plan 2021–2024' (P.130/2020), as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)) and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)Amd.), agreed that for the words "£2.6 million", there should be substituted the words "£750,000" and that for the words "for the completion of this project", there should be substituted the words ", subject to the agreement of an updated business case and after the Jersey Heritage Trust and Ministers have worked together to thoroughly investigate other potential funding mechanisms".

THE STATES resumed consideration of the amendment of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.130/2020 Amd.(12)Amd.(2)), agreed that, for the words "repair and maintenance of Elizabeth Castle", there should be substituted the words "development of Elizabeth Castle, including the Hospital and Officers' Quarters and the revised business case for that development"; and that for the words "in 2022 and 2023", there should be substituted the words "in subsequent years to complete the development, no later than the end of 2025".

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade, as amended, agreed that in paragraph (f), after the words "of the Report" there should be inserted the words —

", except that, in Summary Table 5(i), the Heads of Expenditure for Financial Services and Digital shall be increased by £750,000 in 2021 in order to fund the development of Elizabeth Castle, including the Hospital and Officers' Quarters and the revised business case for that development, with a commitment that funding shall be provided in subsequent years to complete the development, no later than the end of 2025, subject to the agreement of an updated business case and after the Jersey Heritage Trust and Ministers have worked together to thoroughly investigate other potential funding mechanisms, and that any such funding shall be over and above the 1% allocation for Culture, Arts and Heritage of overall expenditure".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 43 CONTRE: 0 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator I.J. Gorst

Senator L.J. Farnham

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré

Senator T.A. Vallois

Senator K.L. Moore

Senator S.W. Pallett

Senator S.Y. Mézec

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Saviour

Connétable of St. Brelade

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. John

Connétable of St. Quen

Connétable of St. Martin

Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

Deputy of Grouville

Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

Deputy M. Tadier (B)

Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)

Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy of St. Ouen

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)

Deputy R. Labey (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)

Deputy J.H. Young (B)

Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)

Deputy K.F. Morel (L)

Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy of Trinity

Deputy of St. John

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)

Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)

Deputy R.J. Ward (H)

Deputy C.S. Alves (H)

Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier (P.130/2020 Amd.(19)) that in paragraph (f), after the words "Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report" there should be inserted the words –

", except that in Summary Table 5(ii) the overall head of expenditure shall be reduced by £200,000 through the removal of funding allocated to States of Jersey Police Firearms Range, and that the overall head of expenditure in Summary Table 5(i) shall be increased by £200,000 to allow for a grant to be given to the Institute of Law in order that the Institute can provide pro bono legal services for those who cannot afford lawyers or legal aid, assist litigants in persons with cases that they wish to bring, and help with any perceived miscarriages of justice"

Members present voted as follows –

## POUR: 16 CONTRE: 30 ABSTAIN: 0

Senator S.C. Ferguson Senator I.J. Gorst Senator S.Y. Mézec Senator L.J. Farnham Connétable of St. Helier Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré Connétable of St. Lawrence Senator T.A. Vallois Connétable of St. Peter Senator S.W. Pallett Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. Clement Deputy G.P. Southern (H) Connétable of St. Brelade Deputy M. Tadier (B) Connétable of Grouville Deputy M.R. Higgins (H) Connétable of Trinity Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) Connétable of St. Mary Deputy R. Labey (H) Connétable of St. Ouen Deputy J.H. Perchard (S) Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

Deputy R.J. Ward (H) Deputy C.S. Alves (H) Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S) Deputy I. Gardiner (H) Deputy of Grouville Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) Deputy of St. Martin Deputy of St. Ouen

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

Deputy S.M. Wickender (1)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
Deputy J.H. Young (B)
Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy of St. John

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H) Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(a), Senator Kristina Louise Moore declared an interest and withdrew from the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the amendment of Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier (P.130/2020 Amd.(19)).

## Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Tuesday 15th December 2020, to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Government Plan 2021–2024' (P.130/2020), as amended, the outstanding accompanying amendments and the other outstanding items of public business listed for the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 5.48 p.m.

L.-M. HART

Deputy Greffier of the States